SUBJECT: Hiring Procedures for Colleges 2012-2013 Audit

PROPOSED BOARD ACTION

Accept the Hiring Procedures for Colleges 2012-2013 Audit provided on May 20, 2014 to President Wilson Bradshaw, Vice President and General Counsel Vee Leonard, and Assistant Vice President and Director of Human Resources Christine Lloyd.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

This report presents the results of a limited scope audit of the hiring procedures for positions hired in the College of Engineering and the College of Health Professions and Social Work during fiscal year 2012-2013. The audit objective was to determine whether individuals hired by the two Colleges were processed according to University policies and procedures. The processes include, but are not limited to, recruiting personnel and administration of new hire paperwork after an applicant has accepted the position.

The audit was part of the 2013-2014 internal audit work plan approved by the FGCU Board of Trustees at its June 18, 2013 meeting.

Upon acceptance of the report by the FGCU Board of Trustees, a copy of the report will be sent to the Board of Governors as required.

Supporting Documentation Included: Hiring Procedures for Colleges 2012-2013 Audit Issued May 20, 2014

Prepared by: Director of Internal Audit Carol Slade

Legal Review by: Associate General Counsel Lisa Jones (May 19, 2014)

Submitted by: President Wilson G. Bradshaw
INTERNAL Audit
Office of the President

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

To: Vee Leonard, Vice President and General Counsel
    Christine Lloyd, Assistant Vice President and Director of Human Resources

Cc: Dr. Wilson Bradshaw, President
    Susan Evans, Vice President and Chief of Staff

From: Deborah McEwan, CIA, Senior Auditor
      Carol Slade, CPA, CIA, Director, Internal Audit

Date: May 20, 2014

Re: Hiring Procedures for Colleges 2012-2013 (FINAL REPORT)

Please see the attached final report of the Hiring Procedures for Colleges 2012-2013, which includes the management response. The report is dated May 14, 2014, which is the date Internal Audit received the management response from the Assistant Vice President and Director of Human Resources.

On May 19, 2014, Lisa Jones, Associate General Counsel, completed a legal review of the audit report.

The audit was performed by Deborah McEwan, Senior Auditor and reviewed by Carol Slade, Director, Internal Audit.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report represents a limited-scope audit of the University’s hiring procedures specifically for positions hired in the College of Engineering and the College of Health Professions and Social Work during fiscal year 2012-2013. During the fiscal year, 3 positions in the College of Engineering were filled and 9 positions in the College of Health Professions and Social Work were filled for a combined total of 12 positions.

In general, these positions were filled in accordance with University policies and procedures. More specifically, the recruiting of personnel and the administration of new hire paper work were performed within University guidelines. Notwithstanding, as of the date of this Report, Management should strengthen procedures to enhance record keeping requirements. One Observation/Recommendation on Page 4 of this Report provides further details.

OBJECTIVES

A. To determine whether individuals hired by the College of Health Professions and Social Work during fiscal year 2012-2013 were processed according to University policies and procedures. These processes include, but are not limited to, recruiting personnel and administration of new hire paperwork after an applicant has accepted the position.

B. To determine whether individuals hired by the College of Engineering during fiscal year 2012-2013 were processed according to University policies and procedures. These processes include, but are not limited to, recruiting personnel and administration of new hire paperwork after an applicant has accepted the position.

This audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing, issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors. The audit procedures provided a reasonable basis for our opinion and the following reportable observation and recommendation.

SCOPE – End of field work was April 17, 2014

• Reviewed FGCU policies and procedures pertaining to hiring, more specifically the FGCU Search and Screen Guidelines. The Guidelines state: “It provides Hiring Officials and decision makers with necessary information and guidance to meet the requirements of state and federal nondiscrimination legislation.”

• Reviewed FGCU policies and regulations within the scope of hiring requirements (e.g. Criminal Background Checks, Outside Employment/Activities, and Sponsorship of Foreign Personnel, etc.)
GENERAL INFORMATION

According to its website, the Human Resources (HR) Department is committed to providing leadership and support to the University community through Human Resources management best practices:

- Recognizing the importance of each individual.
- Demonstrating respect in our actions and in our working relationships.
- Providing best practice HR tools and consultation.
- Being an advocate for creating a respectful and inclusive workplace.
- Providing balanced expert advice with hands-on assistance in our collaborative relationships.
- Understanding the full nature of the work of our clients as we seek to be strategic partners.
- Ensuring the consistent application of University policies and procedures, taking into account each set of circumstances.

The hiring process may be considered decentralized since Hiring Officials are located throughout the University in various departments and units. The University President possesses the ultimate authority to decide on the final outcome of any search process and offer employment. However, this authority is typically delegated to the respective presidential direct reports who may delegate it further to deans/directors or comparable positions, as applicable.

Search and Screen Guidelines

On a procedural level, the HR Department provides Search and Screen Guidelines (Guidelines) to all University employees to assist in the hiring process. These Guidelines “are a comprehensive resource for all recruitment efforts at FGCU. It provides Hiring Officials and decision makers with necessary information and guidance to meet the requirements of state and federal nondiscrimination legislation.”

Search Advisory Committee vs. Interview Panel

Hiring Officials may conduct searches with the assistance of a Search Advisory Committee or an Interview Panel. A Search Advisory Committee is usually chosen to fill all ranked full-time faculty, librarian, and Administrative and Professional positions at the director level and above. The Search Advisory Committee is a diverse group of FGCU employees, who assist by developing a list of job criteria, creating/selecting interview questions, screening and interviewing applicants, and finally recommending two or more candidates to the Hiring Official. Typically, an Interview Panel is also a diverse group of FGCU employees; however, their responsibilities are limited to conducting interviews and providing feedback to the Hiring Official on the attributes of each applicant interviewed.
OBSERVATION AND RECOMMENDATION

Record Keeping within the Search and Screen Guidelines (Guidelines)

Condition

During this audit, 8 of the 12 position searches were conducted with assistance from a Search Advisory Committee. A majority of recruitment files representing the searches conducted by a Search Advisory Committee did not contain meeting notices or meeting minutes in the file documentation. Although some searches referred to meeting notices and/or minutes that were previously posted or recorded, the actual notices and minutes could not be located in the file.

Criteria

The Guidelines address the Searching in the Sunshine Requirements beginning on page 13 and record keeping requirements are fully delineated on the bottom of page 14:

Record Keeping

All documents/communications related to the search, including letters of reference, meeting minutes (if appropriate), meeting notices, matrix, documented reference checks, correspondence, Search Advisory Committee member notes on candidates, and email messages are to be submitted to Human Resources and may be public records. It is the responsibility of the Search Advisory Committee and/or Hiring Official/Interview Panel Chair to make certain that all materials have been forwarded to Human Resources liaison at the end of the search process. Interview questions are exempt from disclosure until the hiring process is completed.

These records are subject to Florida's Sunshine Laws. State record retention guidelines require that Search Advisory Committee/Interview Panel records be maintained for a minimum of four (4) years after the position is filled, provided there is no pending complaint or litigation.

Cause

Due to the decentralized hiring structure, Hiring Officials do not consistently return all required search materials at the end of a search as instructed in the Guidelines and reiterated by Human Resources employment specialists.

Effect

If a public records request for a particular search is requested, FGCU may not have all the required search materials on file such as meeting notices and meeting minutes.
Recommendation

To augment recruitment file documentation, management should revise the checklists used by both the Hiring Officials and HR employment specialists participating in the new hiring process. These checklists may be expanded and revised to verify the specific inclusion of items such as meeting notices and meeting minutes in the hiring documentation prior to closing related files.

Furthermore, HR management should consider uploading these documents into SOAR (Self-managed Online Automated Resources), the University’s web-based online job posting and employment website that is used to process vacancies. According to HR management, the interview questions and the matrix of applicants are routinely uploaded into SOAR.

Management Response

HR agrees with the observation and the recommendation as to augmentation to the recruitment file. To that end, HR will make changes in the Search and Screen Guidelines, as follows, to the current practices to ensure file documentation compliance:

- HR will revise the checklist for Hiring Officials (APPENDIX A)
- HR will revise the checklist for HR Employment Specialists (APPENDIX B)
- HR will revise the Request for Search Materials email sent to the Search Advisory Committee Chair at the end of the recruitment (APPENDIX C)

The absence of the meeting notices and meeting minutes is not resolved by uploading these documents into SOAR. In order to comply with retention requirements for meeting notices and minutes, I propose to increase communication to the Search Advisory Committee Chair and administrative staff, both before and after the recruitment process. Furthermore, by adding a step on the HR Employment Specialist checklist to ensure receipt of the meeting notices and meeting minutes, this will provide a final check point before the file is placed into storage.

Provided by: Christine Lloyd, Assistant Vice President & Director of Human Resources

Responsible person: Christine Lloyd, Assistant Vice President & Director of Human Resources

Implementation date: May 6, 2014: As soon as we were made aware of this issue, the checklists were modified and HR immediately began using them for all new recruitments. Additionally, we will request the documents for all active searches prior to closing the files.

Audit Performed by: Deborah McEwan, Senior Auditor

Audit Reviewed by: Carol Slade, Director of Internal Audit
APPENDIX A

APPENDIX D(1) - Search Advisory Committee Checklist

1. ___ SOAR Username & Password provided to Hiring Official, Chair and Committee members.

2. ___ HR Jobs email notifies Hiring Official & Chair when position has closed. HR reviews the applicant pool for minimum qualifications. Note: The Applicant pool is not accessible during the HR Review.

3. ___ HR Jobs email notifies Hiring Official & Chair when the applicant pool has been certified by the Office of Equity & Diversity and is ready for review.

4. ___ Committee may begin reviewing applicants and complete the Matrix.

5. ___ Prepare interview questions and submit to HR for review and approval
   ___ Telephone Interview Questions and/or
   ___ Onsite Interview Questions

Note: If planning to conduct Onsite Interviews only, continue to Step #10

6. ___ Email completed Matrix and interview list to HR
   ___ Completed Matrix and
   ___ Telephone Interview List

7. ___ HR Jobs email notifies Hiring Official & Chair when the Matrix & Telephone Interview List have been certified by the Office of Equity & Diversity for interviews.

8. ___ Conduct & document Reference Checks (minimum of 2) before candidates are invited on campus (exclude current employer, unless approved by candidate). Use form (Appendix E) or submit revised form to HR for approval.

9. ___ Schedule and conduct Telephone interviews.

10. ___ Email completed Matrix (if not submitted previously) and interview list to HR
    ___ Completed Matrix and
    ___ Onsite Interview List

11. ___ HR Jobs email notifies Hiring Official & Chair when the Matrix & Onsite Interview List have been certified by the Office of Equity & Diversity for interviews.

12. ___ Conduct & document Reference Checks (minimum of 2) before candidates are invited on campus (exclude current employer, unless approved by candidate). Use form (Appendix E) or submit revised form to HR for approval.

13. ___ Schedule and conduct Onsite interviews.

14. ___ Candidate(s) are recommended to Hiring Official or Dean/Director by changing candidates status to "Finalist" in SOAR.

15. ___ Hiring official or designee conducts reference check of finalist’s current employer. Advise finalist before calling current employer.

16. ___ Hiring official completes appointment form in SOAR and submits to Dean/Director for approval. Appointment form is routed for appropriate approvals.

17. ___ HR Jobs email notifies Hiring Official of approval to extend a Verbal Offer.

18. ___ Hiring Official may contact the candidate and extend a verbal offer, negotiate the salary within the advertised salary range, and any other conditions of the offer. Notify HR if there are any changes to the submitted appointment form & confirm acceptance of offer.

19. ___ HR will request all search materials (reference checks, interview responses, meeting notices, emails, meeting minutes, etc.) from the chair. Each committee member is required to return search materials for documentation.
Closing Recruiting Files Checklist

Position #: ______________ Requisition #: ____________ College/Dept. ________________________________

Employment Specialist: ______________________ Position Filled: ______________________ Email Sent: __________

Completed by: _____________________________ New Incumbent: _______________________________

___ Received signed copy of offer letter.

Log into SOAR:

___ Search for the Job Posting by Requisition number
___ Print HR Qualified Applicants Report
___ View applicants by clicking on “View” under the position title
___ Change New Incumbent’s status from “Offer Letter Sent” to “Offer Accepted”
___ Change all non-hired applicants’ status to “Position Filled – Send Email.” Email notification will be forwarded to all applicants not hired. NOTE: If the position was cancelled, select “Position Canceled – Send Email.” To change all non-hired applicants, select “All” and then select “Change Multiple Applicants Status.”
___ Select “View Recruitment Summary” at the bottom of page.
___ Select “Verbal Offer Accepted.” Click “Continue.” Click “Confirm”
___ Click on “Position Filled” link to close out position. NOTE: If the position was cancelled, select “Position Canceled” link.  
___ Ensure Advertising Tab contains all advertising venues (i.e. contracted advertising, ad costs, additional advertising, social media).
___ Ensure all documents are saved in SOAR (i.e. matrix, interview questions, candidate fingerprint form, etc.).
___ Print out final Recruitment Plan [Note: File in Section One]
___ Place Checklist for Closing Recruiting Files, signed Offer Letter, conditional offer letter, candidate acceptance email, and Veteran’s Preference Process checklist in recruitment file. (Veterans Preference is for SP positions only)
___ *Ensure all search materials are received. Notify HR Recruiter if materials have not been returned.

___ If materials have not been received, send e-mail to the chair of the committee to request the search materials (reference checks, interview responses, meeting notices, e-mails, meeting minutes, etc.) be returned. (Same day as Closing/Cancelling position)

- Send 2nd request (Subject Line: 2nd Request) copying hiring official no later than 2 weeks from the date of initial e-mail
- Send Final request (Subject Line: Final Request) copying Dean/Director no later than 2 weeks from the date of initial e-mail. Once search materials have been requested 3 times, place email notifications in Recruiting File, and log Recruiting File on Working Storage List.

___ **Place new incumbent references in their personnel file.

___ File search materials in the last section of the recruitment file.

___ Place Recruiting File on Working Storage List (H:\Storage-Records Working Storage), once the file has been completely closed out.

___ Verify new incumbent has been added to the appropriate organizational chart.
Committee Chair,

I am currently closing the recruitment file for Req. #____, position title, Pos. #____.

Please send all search materials used during this search (reference checks, interview responses, meeting notices, e-mails, minutes, etc.). Documented reference checks are required for the personnel file of the hired incumbent (Name of incumbent).

Please forward me these documents as soon as possible because they are a part of the recruitment documentation process.

Thank you,